

**LMI Advisory Group
Thursday, May 26, 2011
Meeting Minutes**

Attendees

Chin, Alex	Health Workforce Development Council / CWIB
Della Valle, Richard	Economic Workforce Development CCC
Harris, Laura (via WebEx)	Riverside Workforce Development / California Employer Advisory Council
Kelly, Neil (via WebEx)	California Department of Education Adult Education Office
Lane, Moreen	Health Workforce Development Council / CWIB
Lovell, Vicky	California Budget Project
McAloon, Jill	Employment Training Panel
Minjares, Javier	Southern California Association of Governments
Odom, Beverly	California Workforce Investment Board
Reid, Dennis	Bureau of Labor Statistics
Rogers, Christina	
Staton, Roy	EDD / Workforce Services Branch
Van Court, Jason	California Research Bureau
White, Maureen	CCCCO / Career Technology Education
Wiseley, Chuck	CCC Chancellor's Office

LMID Staff

Alvarado, Alex (via WebEx)	Roberts, Beverly
Bal, Bindy	Sanders, Brandy
Boucher, Michael - Note Taker	Saxton, Steve
Del Gallego, Karen - Note Taker	Shimanek, Loren - Note Taker
Gonzales, Margo	Singh, Lilly
Hax, Linda	Smith, Marilyn
Jackson, Terilyn	Solorio, Cynthia (Facilitator)
Lee, Robert (via WebEx)	Wessen, Paul
Mar, Brian	Williams, Sharon
McClellan, Judi (Facilitator)	Wong, Linda (via WebEx)
Neighbours, Adam - Note Taker	

Welcome / Introductions

Cynthia Solorio: This is the first time attendees can join the meeting using WebEx.

- Introductions were made including WebEx attendees.
- Some WebEx attendees were unable to view the California Budget Project presentation slides. Adjustments were made and all attendees were able to view the slides during the afternoon session.

Review of Minutes

- The January 27th, 2011 meeting minutes were reviewed and approved.

Division Update

- No update was provided.

Guest Speakers

California Budget Project (CBP) – Vicky Lovell, Senior Policy Analyst

- CBP is a non-partisan, non-profit, independent organization.
- CBP is supported by donations from individuals, organizations, publication subscriptions, and grants from private foundations.
- The CBP mission is to engage in independent fiscal and policy analysis and public education with the goal of improving public policies that affect the economic and social well-being of low and middle-income Californians.
- The California Budget Project (CBP) uses data from the California Employment Development Department, Labor Market Information Division (LMID) and other data sources to provide context for budget discussions and get State-level data filtered down to the local level.
- Publications:
 - Budget analyses:
 - Same-day analyses;
 - Chartbook to provide overview and context;
 - Side-by-side comparisons of proposals;
 - Impact analyses by county, school, and legislative district.
 - Focus on key issues: tax policy; economy; access to health care; human services; school finance; unemployment insurance; workforce development.
- Other activities:
 - Educating the public:
 - Annual public policy conference; presentations and legislative testimony; budget training (local groups); newsletter; blog.
 - Technical assistance:
 - Resources for policymakers; constituency groups; and the media.
- All CBP publications are available online (http://www.cbp.org/publications/pub_browse.html).

Examples of available information:

- The slide presentation used graphical displays of data to illustrate the dynamism of CBP analysis.
- A series of slides entitled “How Do California's Schools Compare?” used print media sources and U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis data to illustrate the following points:
 - In 2010-11 California ranked 47th in per pupil spending (\$8,908) as compared to the US (\$11,397 per pupil);
 - In 2006-07, California ranked 42nd in students graduating with a diploma (percentage figure). The data analysis made available by the CBP provides a particular context for policy implications in California, as opposed to U.S. policy as a whole.
- A slide entitled “Seventy Percent of Enterprise Tax Zone Credits Go to Corporations With Assets of \$1 Billion or More” used Franchise Tax Board data to examine a budget proposal to end the [Enterprise Zone Tax Program](#).
- Another slide used data from the California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office to illustrate the point that high school students who took college preparatory classes were more likely to earn an Associates Degree and/or transfer to a four-year institution than students who took only general education courses.

Comments & Discussion:

- **Chuck Wiseley:** Did CBP control for socio-economic status?
- **Vicky Lovell:** We did not feel there was a robust variable for socio-economic status, but we did include a variable for geographic location.
- A series of slides illustrated how the CBP uses EDD and Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) data to contextualize the current employment situation and go beyond data to examine changes in the California labor market.

- (slide 18) The California economy saw job gains of +200,000 between September 2010 and March 2011, yet more than one million Californians have been looking for work for over 6 months.
- (slide 19) Unemployment rates for Latinos and Whites have leveled-off, but the unemployment rate for African Americans has increased since the recession ended.
- (slide 20) Examines the number of job seekers compared to the number of available jobs.

Comments & Discussion:

- **Chuck Wisely:** What report did the job openings chart come from?
- **Steve Saxton:** Job Opening and Labor Turnover Survey (JOLTS), a BLS program.
- **Dennis Reid:** (explains) It is a small national survey of 16,000 businesses.
- **Steve Saxton:** (replies) There are states that do job vacancy surveys, something California has never done; we are starting to use some online job-add tools (i.e. Wanted Analytics), yet most of these tools do not always successfully cover the range of occupations and industries.
- **Steve Saxton:** You guys (the CBP) produce a nice summary report on workforce programs, any plans to update?
- **Vicky Lovell:** It is a compendium of different departments that fund worker training; we have not talked about updating, but I will mention it.
- **Jason Van Court:** How long has CBP been around and how many employees?
- **Vicky Lovell:** CBP started in 1994. We have five policy analysts, an intern, two communications employees, and an office manger.

Economic Update – Paul Wesson

- The California and the national economy are growing.
- However, expansion is slow and has a long way to go to match peak levels of pre-recession employment.
- All geographic regions of the state were severely affected by the recession. Coastal areas are recovering well while inland areas continue to struggle.
- California's current economic picture shows that the recovery is gathering momentum.
 - The unemployment rate for April 2011 is 11.9 percent. This is the first time California's unemployment rate fell below 12 percent since August 2009.
 - California's unemployment rate has decreased .06 percent in four months.
 - Nonfarm payroll jobs have increased a total of 207,000 in the last seven months.
- California lost over 1.3 million jobs between July 2007 and September 2009;
 - Job losses dominate everything, including the perception of job seekers.

Comments & Discussion:

- **Maureen White:** Is there a way of looking at job losses and job gains? How many of the people who lost jobs are part of the job gains? Is there a way to track this?
 - **Paul Wesson:** These are kind of shaky numbers: 36.8 percent have been unemployed 6 months; 52 weeks or longer is over 30 percent; and two years or longer is about 5.5 percent. The long-term unemployed are a distinctive feature of recession.
- There have been nonfarm payroll job gains six out of seven months with an increase of about 20,000 jobs a month.
 - Nationally, and in California, the year-over percentage gain of total employment is 1 percent. This does not include government job losses, just private sector jobs.

- A series of slides compared prior economic down-turns with the severity of the recent recession.

Comments & Discussion:

- **Chuck Wiseley:** So you're thinking this recovery will be somewhere between the 1980's and the 1990's?
- **Paul Wessen:** This really looks like it parallels the last two recessions in California. The "gold standard" was 1990's, there was an acceleration of recovering to pre-recession levels, but, it takes a long time to gather steam. Consumption and demand are drivers for a recovery, but it is not apparent these will be the drivers this time; it is hard to see where rapid acceleration is going to come from.
- **Steve Saxton:** If we look back before the last two recessions, the recovery is symmetrical. The last ones recovered more slowly than they declined, the question is what will this recovery do? In earlier recessions, we did not see a restructuring of the economy. In the 1990s, we completely restructured the defense economy; when military bases were closed. Suddenly, we had a different economic structure in both the public and private sector.
- **Paul Wessen:** Economic restructuring tends to prolong recovery.
- Another series of slides demonstrated how the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) increased over the past seven consecutive quarters.
 - $GDP = \text{Consumer Spending} + \text{Investment} + \text{Government Spending} + \text{Net Exports}$
- All economic inputs are increasing with the exception of federal government spending.
- Even with the stimulus, state and local government are being affected by decreasing tax revenue.
- From June 2008 to April 2011, California lost 136,000 public sector jobs; most of which were from local government.

Comments & Discussion:

- **Roy Staton:** Does the loss of government jobs loss include attrition?
- **Paul Wessen:** Yes.
- **Chuck Wiseley:** Does this include teachers?
- **Paul Wessen:** This is primarily where it is.
- **Steve Saxton:** We produced a list of the 50 largest occupations in state and many are in local government, largely in schools.

[LMID Customer Outreach Unit – Website Update/Customer Survey](#) – Sharon Williams

Website Update

- The Customer Outreach Unit is a new unit within LMID. One of their projects is to redesign LMID's Web site.
- LMID Web Redesign Project goals:
 - Meet customer needs
 - Enhance user experience
 - Align with client demographics
 - Incorporate technology solutions
 - Accurate and released on the Internet in a timely manner
 - Showcase California as a leader in LMI delivery
- LMID Web Site Demographics
 - 80 percent or more of LMID Web site users are students, job seekers, economic developers, LMI analysts, educators, employers, workforce services professionals, other local/state/federal policy makers and stakeholders.
 - other demographics: age, race, gender

- Graphical analysis of visitor and page view data shows a significant spike in average page views since May 2008.

Customer Survey

A Web site user survey was sent to the LMI Advisory Group. Survey recipients were asked to rate the content, navigation, and design of the LMID Web site.

- 47.1 percent of respondents rated the content as excellent, while an equal amount rated it as above average.
- As for navigation, 23.5 percent of respondents rated the site below average for navigation
- As for design, 64.7 percent rated it above average.
- Who uses the Web site:
 - 17.6 percent of respondents best described themselves as economic developers;
 - 11.8 percent as labor market analysts;
 - 11.8 percent as well for workforce partners.
- 47.1 percent of respondents use the LMID Web site monthly; 17.6 percent use it daily.
- 64.7 percent of respondents found it to be somewhat easy to find sought-after information on the LMID Web site;
- 64.7 percent of respondents rated the quality of the information on the LMID Web site as above average.
- 61.1 percent of respondents described the primary purpose of the information they seek as industry trends, while 55.6 percent answered wage research.
- These were the only two categories over 50 percent. 38.9 percent answered the green economy as the primary purpose.
- 83.3 percent of respondents typically research both the [Current Employment Statistics](#) and the [Occupational Employment and Wages](#).
- 72.2 percent usually research the industry and occupational projections.
- 61.1 percent typically research the [Occupational Guides](#), [Occupational Profiles](#) and the [industry trends](#)
- 66.7 percent of respondents answered that they would prefer the Web site to be organized by subject area;
- 68.8 percent of respondents are familiar with Web 2.0 features blogs and communications tools, such as Skype and Go-to meeting.
- 62.5 percent are familiar with video sharing, such as YouTube, and social networking, such as Facebook and Twitter.
- 56.3 percent are familiar with audio/video podcasting, collaborative authoring, such as Wikis, and Smartphone applications, such as iPhone and Android.
- Additional suggestions from respondents include more webinar features and more resources for career professionals.
- Products available on Facebook and Twitter include the [LMI e-Newsletter](#), reports on the [green economy](#), the [California Occupational Guides](#), [GIS maps](#), and [Help Wanted Online](#) outputs.
- [EDD's Home Page](#) includes links to [Unemployment Insurance](#), [Disability Insurance](#), and [Tax Programs](#).

Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) – Javier Minjares

- SCAG overview
 - SCAG is the largest of 700 metropolitan planning organizations in the country.
 - An 84-member board that is comprised of local elected officials governs it. It's size is due to the inclusion of representation from neighboring counties in order to diminish the notion that SCAG might be too "Los Angeles-centric." There is also representation from six Native American tribes within the association's borders.

- SCAG consists of 6 counties (Imperial, Los Angeles, Orange, Riverside, San Bernardino, and Ventura), 190 cities, and over 18 million residents. If the Association's boundaries were its own country, they would have the 15th largest economy in the world.
- SCAG undertakes a variety of planning and policy initiatives to encourage a more sustainable Southern California. Its focus is to maintain the quality of life in Southern California while maintaining effective collaboration with state, federal, local, and community leaders and entities.
- SCAG addresses many regional challenges, including, but not limited to, congestion, the economy, the environment, climate change, and an aging infrastructure.
- Education
 - SCAG is working in conjunction with area school districts.
 - 42.3 percent of individuals 25 years of age or older in Southern California are educated at the high school level or less. This is compared to 31.8 percent of Bay Area residents and 40.3 percent statewide in the same demographic.
 - As for those who hold bachelor's degrees or higher, the Southern California region is home to 28.7 percent of these individuals as compared to 41.5 percent in the Bay Area and 29.9 percent statewide.
 - The Southern California region needs both short and long-term education plans plus the development of core industries.
- Income
 - The median income for Southern California is \$58,331, very close to the state median income of \$58,931.
 - Of the six member counties, Ventura and Orange Counties have higher-than-median incomes, while the Inland Empire, Imperial, and Los Angeles counties have lower-than-median incomes.
 - Imperial County is pleased that SCAG is developing plans for them in part because the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) did not generate the anticipated economic growth,
- Economic Recovery and Job Creation Strategy Recommendations
 - Retain and expand the region's high-tech manufacturing and research & development base.
 - Restore the manufacturing investment credit.
 - Create a "Green Team" to develop an expanded definition of green industries and work to retain and grow green activities in the state.
 - Designate "Enterprise Counties" where unemployment exceeds 10 percent (e.g. Imperial Co.)
 - Accelerate and extend successful State Film Incentive Program
- SCAG Local Profiles
 - SCAG also produces [local profiles](#) for the different regions. These were recently updated for 2011. They are available on the SCAG Web site and they were also mailed to politicians in the region.
 - Salary Data by Sector
 - In 2009, the sector providing the highest salary per job in the city was Information (\$121,949).
 - The 'Other Services' sector provided the lowest annual salary per job (\$34,306).
 - This information is usually requested by companies looking to open new businesses.

- Employment by Sector
 - In 2010, the Professional-Management sector was the largest job sector, accounting for 24.2 percent of total jobs in the city.
 - Other large sectors included Education & Health (18.3 percent), Leisure & Hospitality (13.2 percent), and Information (12 percent).
 - Long-term Employment Forecast
 - This slide indicates the expected employment growth from 2003-2035. Long-range transportation plan (5-year increments to 2035). Look at EDD data – distribution by sector.
- Comments:**
- **Vicky Lovell:** Why isn't San Diego a part of SCAG?
 - **Javier Minjares:** They have a slightly different transportation/commute pattern than other SCAG member counties.

**California Workforce Investment Board / Health Workforce Development Council –
Moreen Lane and Alex Chin**

- Title V - Healthcare Workforce Plan
 - By 2014, 8 million more people will have access to health care
 - Different service delivery models to accommodate increased need are becoming available (e.g., nurse-run clinics)
 - High numbers of graduating nurses are having difficulty finding a job.
 - Distribution of workers becomes a huge topic of conversation - need to be considered for California
 - Dr. Katherine Flores and Mr. Zarkin (former legal counsel for Kaiser) are helping in the process
 - Developing a minimum data set
- Senate Bill 293
 - Last August – the Health Workforce Development Council was formed to create a comprehensive strategy that will address the needs of providing healthcare
 - The mission of the Health Workforce Development Council is to expand California's healthcare workforce to provide access to quality healthcare for all Californians
 - The Council consists of members of the public, representatives from non profit organizations, education/licensing agencies and state healthcare agencies
- Created regional collaboration/partnerships
 - Discovered that what works in El Centro could be used by some populations in San Diego
 - Fast tracked study to gain grant money
 - Had series of 11 regional focus groups to identify best practices and barriers
 - Focus groups revealed a disconnect between education programs and the workforce
- Workforce Development model
 - Lab workers needed
 - Have to look at the data – healthcare is really changing, going more retail (for example, due to lack of positions in hospital pharmacies, many are going to places like Rite Aid or Target for pharmacy positions)

Comments & Discussion:

- **Roy Staton:** Does the pharmacy technician job at CVS pay the same as one in a hospital?
- **Moreen Lane:** No, the hospital pays more.
- **Chuck Wiseley:** A challenge for training people for future workforce needs is that many are just considering current needs.

- **Alex Chin:**
 - 22 licensing entities
 - Each training provider has ability to submit data.
 - Looking to finish by June.
 - Second phase is generating a report.
- **Jason Van Court:** Are you going to include Veteran data?
- **Alex Chin:** We're looking at North Carolina as an example since they are doing something similar.
- **Moreen Lane:** We're trying to get some consistency in the data.

Wrap-Up & Adjourn:

+	△
Improved conference call audio for afternoon	For conference call: have speaker repeat questions
Prefer early start time for meeting	Monitor WebEx with questions
Good content from non-LMID speakers / cont. the hybrid	Do more research for those traveling in / let that be a gauge
Can we record WebEx?	Glitches: conference call / WebEx
Good content with related discussion	Meeting wizard should be sent out earlier
Continue to offer the option of joining the meeting via WebEx	

- Next meeting: TBD, possibly End of August or beginning of September – We will send out tentative dates for the next meeting and vote.
- Proposed topics for the next meeting:
 - Economic Indicators (Paul)
 - Budget recap (if we have one!)
 - ARRA Grant Progress
 - GIS; GTI; Demo
 - Real Time LMI
 - What are ERs asking for?
 - Update Web redesign